

COMPOSING MUSIC FOR THE FEAST OF FOOLS: The Case of the *Kyrie Asini*

Max Harris

In the spring of 2004, Paris's Musée de la Musique staged an exhibition of medieval art depicting a wide variety of period music making. The exhibition, 'Moyen Âge: entre ordre et désordre', was accompanied by a lavish catalogue that included a series of scholarly essays, a full complement of colour illustrations, and a CD compilation of largely medieval vocal music drawn from previously issued recordings. One of the musical tracks, taken from the Clemencic Consort's 1980 LP, *La Fête de l'Âne*, was a parodic troped kyrie known as the *Kyrie Asini* ('Kyrie of the Ass').¹ In his program notes to the Musée de la Musique CD, professor of musicology Olivier Cullin dated the *Kyrie Asini* to the 'thirteenth century'.² Certainly by 2004 the *Kyrie Asini* was an established part of the repertoire of recorded music supposedly having its origins in the thirteenth-century northern French Feast of Fools, but Cullin was mistaken in ascribing it to the thirteenth century. The *Kyrie Asini* is almost certainly a much more recent composition.

Not only were the musicians of the Clemencic Consort the first to record the *Kyrie Asini*, but their version also differs from all subsequent recordings of the piece. On the Clemencic Consort album, the *Kyrie Asini* has two parts, the first largely in Latin (with a sprinkling of Greek) and the second largely in French. Subsequent recordings, as well as the Musée de la Musique compilation, include only the first part. A further peculiarity appears in the program notes to the Clemencic Consort album. These routinely provide the words for the album's vocal tracks in four parallel columns: the first gives the Latin (or, in one case, Provençal) original; the other three offer French, English, and German translations. The *Kyrie Asini* is the sole exception to this pattern. With this piece, the Latin column is left blank, and the words of the second part are printed in the French column as if they were a translation of the missing Latin original. The English and German columns duly provide translations of the French.

The full text of the *Kyrie Asini*, transcribed directly from the Clemencic Consort recording, is as follows:

Kyrie eleison.

Asini hec est dies solemnus ergo asine eleison.

Christe eleison.

Hinhan hinhan hinhan hinhan hinhan hinhan eleison.

Kyrie eleison.

Hinhan hinhan hinhan hinhan hinhan hinhan hinhan eleison.

Kyrie: que je voudrais

Eleison: avoir un homme

Christe: me marier!

Sancta: Je prie tous les saints,

Saint-Nicolas: ne m'oubliez pas,

Saint-Stanislas: que mon mariage se fasse,

Saint-Germain: plutôt aujourd'hui que demain!

Lord, have mercy.

This is the festive day of the ass; therefore, ass, have mercy.

Christ, have mercy.

Hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw, have mercy.

Lord, have mercy.

Hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw hee-haw, have mercy.

Lord: how I would like

Have mercy: to have a man

Christ: to marry me.

Holy: I pray to all the saints

Saint Nicholas: don't forget me

Saint Stanislaus: may my wedding take place

Saint Germanus: rather today than tomorrow.

I begin my inquiry into the origins of the *Kyrie Asini* with its second half, since the source of the French text is comparatively easy to trace and only the Clemencic Consort has recorded it. The Musée de la Musique judiciously omitted the French portion of the Clemencic track from its own compilation CD, perhaps because Cullin knew full well that this part did not date to the thirteenth century. By dealing with the simpler puzzle first, I can clear a little ground before embarking on the more complex and more influential matter of the Latin text.

René Clemencic's program notes are frustratingly vague about his sources. The consort's 'performance', he writes, represents an attempt to 'reconstruct' a typical Feast of Fools 'based on partly unpublished medieval

manuscripts'. He claims that his 'principal source' for the music on the disc 'has been the Beauvais "Officium Circumcisionis" (British Museum, Egerton 2615)', but also admits to using 'occasional secular songs'. Despite Clemencic's claim to have consulted 'unpublished' manuscripts, a critical edition of the thirteenth-century Beauvais Office of the Circumcision contained in Egerton 2615 had been published, with full text and music, by Wulf Arlt in 1970.³ It is therefore easy to discover that only seven of the twenty-eight pieces on the Clemencic Consort album — no more than a quarter — come from the Beauvais Office of the Circumcision. Most of the others can be traced to a variety of readily available published sources having little or nothing to do with the Feast of Fools.

Clemencic appears to have found the second part of his *Kyrie Asini* in Eero Ilvonen's *Parodies de thèmes pieux dans la poésie française du moyen âge* (1914).⁴ Ilvonen sets out the words in almost exactly the same form as they appear in Clemencic's program notes, the only differences being that Clemencic substitutes a colon wherever Ilvonen has a dash and compresses each of Ilvonen's paired lines into a single line. Thus,

— *Kyrie* —
Que je voudrais

in Ilvonen becomes *Kyrie: que je voudrais* in Clemencic. Ilvonen himself found the words in exactly the same form in Eugène Rolland's *Rimes et jeux de l'enfance* (1883).⁵ Clemencic's appropriation of the words for his own attempt to reconstruct a medieval rite long (but mistakenly) thought to have involved parody of the Divine Office suggests that he was influenced by the title of Ilvonen's book. He might have found the text less suited to his purpose had he known that Rolland identified the words with a childish 'rhyme' or 'game'. Nor does Clemencic seem to have been aware of a much longer — and possibly original — version of the text in a popular eighteenth-century catechism offered to young women wanting to be married.⁶ First published in 1715, the catechism is neither medieval nor (although some of the advice it gives may strike the modern ear as very odd) parodic.

None of these sources set *Kyrie, que je voudrais* to music or even implied that the words were supposed to be sung rather than spoken. In the absence of any prescribed musical setting, Clemencic had the first half of each line chanted by a male voice with little or no melodic variation and the second, even more plainly, by a female voice confined to a single note.

Clemencic thus transformed a young woman's private prayer into a generic parody of clerical chant.

Turning now to the first half of Clemencic's *Kyrie Asini*, we find a similar problem in reverse: here the musical setting can be easily identified but the text remains problematic. The music to which Clemencic's Latin text is sung (or brayed) is an abbreviated version of the well-known *Kyrie Cunctipotens*, which itself dates to the tenth century. In this case, Clemencic's claim to have found his source material in the Beauvais Office of the Circumcision is correct, for the entire *Kyrie Cunctipotens* was chanted there during Compline at the feast of the Circumcision.⁷ Whereas the full *Kyrie Cunctipotens* repeats each line of the melody three times, alternating the lines of the Kyrie itself (*Kyrie eleison*, etc.) with lines from the trope (*Cunctipotens genitor, deus omnipreator, eleison*, etc.), the first half of Clemencic's *Kyrie Asini* uses each line of the melody just once. Its words and music may be transcribed as follows:⁸

The transcription consists of seven staves of music, each with a treble clef and a key signature of one flat (B-flat). The lyrics are written below the notes, with hyphens indicating syllables that span multiple notes. The lyrics are as follows:

- Staff 1: Ky - ri - e - - - - e - - - - - le - i - son.
- Staff 2: As - i - ni hec est di - es so - lem - nis er - go as - i - ne e - - - - - le - i - son.
- Staff 3: Chri - ste - - - - - e - - - - - le - i - son.
- Staff 4: Hin - han hin - han hin - han hin - han hin - han hin - han
- Staff 5: e - - - - - le - i - son.
- Staff 6: Ky - ri - e - - - - - e - - - - - le - i - son.
- Staff 7: Hin - han hin - han hin - han hin - han hin - han hin - han hin - han e - - - - - le - i - son.

Transcription of the first half of the Clemencic Consort's recording of the *Kyrie Asini*

As one might expect from the Latin text of the *Kyrie Asini*, the Clemencic Consort treats its musical setting with a great deal less respect than the *Kyrie Cunctipotens* ordinarily received in its familiar context in the Divine Office. Beginning the *Kyrie Asini* as if it were a conventional chant, the singers gradually adopt a mode of delivery that mimics the braying of an ass. While the repeated *hinhans* observe (more or less) the melody of successive verses of *Cunctipotens genitor*, they do so by way of parody not devotion. By the close of the piece, the asinine braying of the choir, accompanied by what sounds like the recorded braying of a real ass, has entirely colonized the sacred music.

The fact that the music of the first half of Clemencic's *Kyrie Asini* can be found in the thirteenth-century Beauvais Office of the Circumcision, by which time it was already about three hundred years old, does not mean that the accompanying text is of similar antiquity. The Latin text of the *Kyrie Asini* is nowhere to be found in the Beauvais Office of the Circumcision.⁹ Nor does it appear in the other two complete Offices of the Circumcision to have survived, those from Sens and Le Puy.¹⁰ Clemencic drew material for his attempted reconstruction of the Feast of Fools from several other well-known manuscript sources of thirteenth-century sacred music, including Codex Wolfenbüttel 677 and Codex Las Huelgas, but the *Kyrie Asini* is in none of these. Nor is it in the *Carmina Burana*, the *Roman de Fauvel*, or the Moosburg Gradual, on which Clemencic further depended. It cannot be found in Du Cange's encyclopedia entry on the festivities of the January Kalends (or its frequent citations in E.K. Chambers's *The Mediaeval Stage*), where Clemencic found material from New Year festivities in Viviers (the three Provençal verses in *Cavalcade*) and Toul (the second verse of *Buccinate*).¹¹ Nor does it appear in the fourteenth-century parodic *Missa de potatoribus* (Mass of the Drinkers), which — in Paul Lehmann's 1963 edition — was the textual source for Clemencic's *Graduale Bachi*, *Vinum bonum*, and *Quantus Dominus Bachus Habaoth*.¹²

Moreover, the *Kyrie Asini* is mentioned in none of the standard studies of medieval parody by Ilvonen, Lehmann or Martha Bayless.¹³ Finally — for what it's worth — Google yields no reference to *Kyrie Asini* prior to the Clemencic Consort recording nor to any part of the text before its first printed appearance in the program notes to the New London Consort recording *The Feast of Fools* (1992).¹⁴ In short, it seems likely that René Clemencic wrote the words himself, attached them to the music of the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*, and so composed (literally, 'put together') the *Kyrie*

Asini to fill a gap in his attempted reconstruction of a typical Feast of Fools.¹⁵

To understand why Clemencic should have done so requires an awareness of the large differences that existed until very recently between the prevailing scholarly narrative of the Feast of Fools, on the one hand, and the words and music of the thirteenth-century bound manuscripts of the Office of the Circumcision that prescribed the words and music of the feast, on the other hand. Since at least 1741, when Jean-Bénigne Lucotte du Tilliot published his influential *Memoires pour servir à l'histoire de la fête des foux*,¹⁶ the Feast of Fools has been widely (and erroneously) regarded as a disorderly Christmas revel, in which drunken medieval clergy elected a burlesque Bishop of Fools, presided over divine office wearing animal masks or women's clothes, sang obscene songs, and otherwise parodied the liturgy of the church. E.K. Chambers perpetuated this view among English-speaking readers in his no less influential *The Medieval Stage* (1903).¹⁷

In my *Sacred Folly: A New History of the Feast of Fools*, I have taken considerable pains to correct this view, demonstrating — from a careful study of all the available documents — that the Feast of Fools developed in the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries as an elaborate and orderly office for the Feast of the Circumcision, stretching from First Vespers on 31 December through Compline, Matins, Lauds, Prime, Terce, Mass, Sext, and Nones, to Second Vespers on 1 January. The intent of the feast was not mockery but thanksgiving for the birth of Christ. Prescribed rôle reversals, in which the lower clergy presided over divine office, recalled Mary's joyous affirmation (celebrated each Vespers in the Magnificat) that God 'has put down the mighty from their seat and exalted the humble' (Luke 1:52). The 'fools' in question were not those who 'despise wisdom and instruction', as the Book of Proverbs put it (Proverbs 1:8), but those whom the apostle Paul declared chosen by God precisely for their lowly status (1 Corinthians 1:27–30, 4:10).

To repeat my argument here in the kind of detail necessary to persuade those for whom the idea of a devout Feast of Fools is still an oxymoron would lengthen this article unduly. Suffice it to say that Clemencic faced a significant difficulty if he was to record music from what he believed to be a typical Feast of Fools. In what is surely a small but telling point against the notion that the feast was habitually disorderly, none of the surviving Offices of the Circumcision provided Clemencic with any material that

conformed to this view of the feast. When it came to drinking songs or parodies of the liturgy, he was forced to turn elsewhere.

Even so, a problem remained. According to Chambers, in thirteenth-century Beauvais, each 14 January, 'a pretty girl, with a child in her arms, was set upon an ass, to represent the Flight into Egypt. There was a procession from the cathedral to the [collegiate] church of St. Stephen. The ass and its riders were stationed on the gospel side of the altar. A solemn mass was sung, in which *Introit*, *Kyrie*, *Gloria* and *Credo* ended with a bray. To crown all, the rubrics direct that the celebrant, instead of saying *Ite missa est*, shall bray three times (*ter hinmannabit*) and that the people shall respond in similar fashion'.¹⁸ Unfortunately, Chambers provided neither text nor music for the brayed *Kyrie*.

Nor did Chambers's source, the 1733 edition of Du Cange's *Glossarium*. The Benedictine editors of this six-volume work were, however, responsible for Chambers' confidence that the practice dated to the thirteenth century, for they had implied that the procession of the ass and the subsequent Mass were recorded in the same 'five-hundred-year-old manuscript volume' (MS. *codex 500 annorum*) as the conductus *Orientis partibus*.¹⁹ Popularly known as 'The Song of the Ass', *Orientis partibus* was chanted at the start of both the Sens and Beauvais Offices of the Circumcision, where it served as an opportunity not for brayed parody but for lively (albeit still dignified) processional worship.²⁰ But the Benedictine editors' implicit dating of the partially brayed Mass is misleading. Their own source was almost certainly a letter, dated 18 December 1697, from Leonor Foy de Saint-Hilaire, a cathedral canon in Beauvais, to 'M. de Francastel, assistant librarian of the Bibliothèque Mazarin in Paris'.²¹ In this letter, Foy de Saint-Hilaire recalled being told by his father of a complete manuscript of *la messe ... de l'asne*, which had been preserved in the collegiate church of St Stephen until the document was 'cruelly burned' by an overscrupulous priest, whom Foy de Sainte-Hilaire remembered from his own childhood. Foy de Sainte-Hilaire's brief description of this mass was subsequently translated into Latin by the editors of Du Cange and thence into English by Chambers. Other than a simple *hin han*, it contained neither text nor music for the brayed endings to the *Introit*, *Kyrie*, *Gloria*, and *Credo*.

No other independent references to such a Mass or to its brayed responses have survived if indeed they ever existed. Subsequent accounts are all derived from Foy de Saint-Hilaire's unsubstantiated third-hand report of a destroyed and undatable manuscript. Nevertheless, by the time that Clemencic set about reconstructing a representative Feast of Fools, the

story of the brayed responses had been so thoroughly folded into the prevailing narrative of the thirteenth-century Feast of Fools that Clemencic apparently felt obliged to include it. Lacking any suitable text, he apparently made one up and set it to the music of the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*.²²

Clemencic's composition — if that's what it is — quickly became an accepted part of the medieval repertoire. The New London Consort, directed by Philip Pickett, was the next to record it. Relying largely on Clemencic's previous 'reconstruction', the New London Consort's *The Feast of Fools*, recorded in February 1990, shares seventeen of its thirty-one tracks with the Clemencic Consort's *La Fête de l'Âne*. The *Kyrie Asini* is among these shared tracks.²³ The New London Consort, however, performs only the first half of the Clemencic *Kyrie Asini*. In his programme notes, Pickett transcribed the Latin text from Clemencic's recording thus:

Kyrie eleison
Asini hec est dies sollemnis
erguasine eleison
Christe eleison
Hinhan eleison
Kyrie eleison
Hinhan eleison

Unless I am very much mistaken, this was the first time that the Latin text of the *Kyrie Asini* had appeared in print.

Pickett, however, made a mistake in his transcription. The alert reader may already have noticed a slight problem in fitting the Latin words of Clemencic's *Kyrie Asini* to the music of the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*. The first half of the second line of the *Kyrie Asini* (*Asini hec est dies sollemnis ergo asine eleison*) has one more syllable than the corresponding half in the *Kyrie Cunctipotens* (*Cunctipotens genitor, deus omnicreator, eleison*). Clemencic solved this problem by eliding the final *o* of *ergo* with the initial *a* of *asine*, so that the four-syllable *ergo asine* sounded more like a three-syllable *erguasine*.²⁴ Pickett transcribed it accordingly. In his English translation of the line ('Ass, whose most solemn day this is, have mercy on us') he deftly skirted the problem of the previously unknown Latin word *erguasine*, providing a translation that was more or less accurate but failed to acknowledge both *asini* and *erguasine*. Pickett's late twentieth-century transcription was to become the authoritative text for the 'thirteenth-century' *Kyrie Asini*.

Although Pickett claimed that his 'principal sources' were 'the Beauvais *Officium Circumcisionis* and the so-called *Missel des Fous* (Office of the Circumcision) of Sens', he also acknowledged use of the Moosburg Gradual and of 'a few other sources, including the *Carmina Burana*, for contemporary parodies and *contrafacta* of the liturgical pieces'. None of these were the source of the *Kyrie Asini*. For that, Pickett paraphrased Chambers' description of the processional ass and brayed responses at Mass in Beauvais. Chambers' account, of course, was not the source of the *Kyrie Asini* but its supposed justification.

Next to record the *Kyrie Asini*, in June 1997, was Ensemble Anonymus, directed by Claude Bernatchez.²⁵ The *Kyrie Asini* is one of nine pieces on *Tempus Festorum: Musique médiévale au temps de la Nativité* (1997) that are supposedly drawn from the Feast of Fools. Six are shared with both the Clemencic and New London Consort recordings; a seventh is shared with only the latter. The Ensemble Anonymus's recording of the *Kyrie Asini* is more restrained than those of the Clemencic and New London Consorts. The Latin text of the *Kyrie Asini* in the Ensemble Anonymus program notes is identical to Pickett's transcription, but the French and English translations of the second line, *C'est le jour solennel de l'âne, donc âne, aie pitié!* (This is the solemn day of the donkey, so have pity on us, donkey!) clearly understand *erguasine* as a corruption of *ergo asine*. In the list of tracks, all but one of the pieces supposedly taken from the Feast of Fools are dated '13th century'. Only the *Kyrie Asini*, properly identified for the first time as 'after the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*', remains undated. Elsewhere in the program notes, however, Irène Bresson is less cautious. She writes of 'the early 13th-century' Offices of the Circumcision in Sens and Beauvais: 'Musicians took advantage of these extraordinary services to produce parodies of such venerable works as the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*.'

It was not long before the text of the *Kyrie Asini* received its first scholarly citation. In his essay, 'Of Musicians and Foolish Refrains', published in 2003, art historian Ward Peinen quoted the full text of the *Kyrie Asini* as it had appeared in Pickett's program notes. His Dutch translation of the second line (*Ezel, dit is uw plechtige dag / ontferm u over ons*), ignoring *erguasine* altogether, reflects his dependence on Pickett, as does his identification of the source as the 'Officium Circumcisionis Beauvais'.²⁶ With each subsequent appearance of the *Kyrie Asini*, its roots in the early thirteenth-century Office of the Circumcision become more confidently asserted.

Finally, we return to the compilation CD issued in 2004 by the Musée de la Musique. Here, for the first time, the *Kyrie Asini* was unequivocally dated to the thirteenth century. Although the text of the *Kyrie Asini* was not printed in the programme notes, Cullin grounded the piece in an entirely fictitious account of its original context. At the Office of the Circumcision, he wrote, a painted ass took the place the bishop and the choir interrupted the liturgy with foolish noises, ‘as is the case in this troped kyrie to the melody of the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*’. Such practices, he added, ‘were increasingly controlled and finally abandoned during the course of the thirteenth century’.²⁷ None of this is true of the Feast of Fools, let alone of the *Kyrie Asini*, but it allowed Cullin to claim the early thirteenth century as the only period in which the *Kyrie Asini* could possibly have been composed. He was wrong.

Some may find the *Kyrie Asini* entertaining. Others may think it blasphemous. But it is certainly not thirteenth-century and it has nothing to do with the Feast of Fools as it was celebrated in northern France at that time. It was, if I am correct, put together by René Clemencic shortly before he recorded *La Fête de l'Âne* in September 1979.

Wisconsin

NOTES

1. *Moyen Age: entre ordre et désordre: Musée de la musique*, 26 mars – 27 juin 2004 edited Marion Chailler and Bernadette Caille (Paris: Cité de la musique, 2004), accompanying CD, track 16; *La Fête de l'Âne*. Clemencic Consort, directed René Clemencic, LP, Harmonia Mundi HM 1036 (1980), track A6a. I am using *parody* here in its modern sense of ‘caricature’ or ‘lampoon’. In the vocabulary of medieval music composition, *parody* signified imitation without any negative connotation: see e.g. Richard Taruskin *The Oxford History of Western Music* 5 vols (Oxford UP, 2010) 1 314, 574.
2. Olivier Cullin ‘Notices des oeuvres musicales’ in Chaillier and Caille *Moyen Âge*, 219–29 (226).
3. Wulf Arlt *Ein Festoffizium des Mittelalters aus Beauvais in seiner liturgischen und musikalischen Bedeutung* 2 vols: [1] *Darstellungsband* und [2] *Editionsband* (Cologne: Arno Volk Verlag, 1970).
4. Eero Ilvonen *Parodies de thèmes pieux dans la poésie française du moyen age* (Helsingfors: Société de Littérature Finnoise, 1914) 41–2.
5. E. Rolland *Rimes et jeux de l'enfance* (Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose, 1883) 339.
6. *Catéchisme à l'usage des grandes filles pour être mariées* (Troyes: Baudot, 1715) 14–15. Thomas Frognall Dibdin *A Biographical, Antiquarian and Picturesque Tour*

- in *France and Germany* 3 vols (London: Robert Jennings and John Major, 2nd edition 1829) 1 89, includes a slightly different version, taken from a later edition of the catechism.
7. Arlt *Festoffizium* 2 29–31. For other transcriptions of the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*, see e.g. Archibald T. Davison and Willi Apel *Historical Anthology of Music* 2 vols (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1964) no 15 (1 13); Taruskin, *Oxford* 1 58–9. For a partial recording of the Beauvais *Kyrie Cunctipotens*, see *Officium festi fatuorum: Office des Fous et Mess de l'âne*, Ensemble Guillaume Dufay, directed Arsène Bedois, LP, Erato STU 71285 (1980) track 12. A simplified version of the *Kyrie Cunctipotens*, without the tropes which gave it its name, is *Kyrie IV* in the *Liber usualis*: see *The Liber usualis*, edited the Benedictines of Solesmes (Tournai: Desclée, 1961) 25.
 8. I am grateful to Jeff DeThorne and Randal Swiggum for help in preparing this transcription.
 9. In addition to MS Egerton 2615, two other sources provide documentary information about the Beauvais Office of the Circumcision. Pierre Louvet, *Histoire et antiquitez du pais de Beauvais* 2 vols (Beauvais: Valet, 1631–1635), 2 299–302, gives a brief description of the divine office in Beauvais during the week after Christmas, for which he is believed to have depended on a now lost MS dating from between 1160 and 1162. David G. Hughes 'Another Source for the Beauvais Feast of Fools' in *Music and Context: Essays for John M. Ward* edited Anne Dhu Shapiro and Phyllis Benjamin (Cambridge MA: Department of Music, Harvard University, 1985) 14–31, provides a detailed account of a seventeenth-century synopsis of a variant of the Beauvais office 'roughly contemporary' with that preserved in BL MS Egerton 2615. Neither of these contains the slightest hint of the *Kyrie Asini*.
 10. For the Sens office, see *Office de Pierre de Corbeil (Office de la Circoncision) improprement appelé «Office des Fous»* edited Henri Villetard (Paris: Alphonse Picard, 1907). For a commendably restrained recording of selections from this office, see *Officium festi fatuorum*, Ensemble Guillaume Dufay. For the Le Puy office, see *Prosolarium ecclesiae aniciensis: Office en vers de la Circoncision en usage dans l'église du Puy* edited Ulysse Chevalier (Paris: Alphonse Picard, 1894); Wulf Arlt 'The Office for the Feast of the Circumcision from Le Puy' translated Lori Kruckenberg, Kelly Landerkin, and Margot Fassler, in *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages* edited Margot E. Fassler and Rebecca A. Baltzer (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), 324–43. For a fine recording of selections from the Beauvais and Le Puy Offices of the Circumcision, see *Le Manuscrit du Puy*, Ensemble Gilles Binchois, directed Dominique Vellard, 2 CDs, Virgin Classics 7243–5–61940–2–1 (2001) CD 1 tracks 15–19 (Beauvais) and CD 2 tracks 1–27 (Le Puy). For a discussion of all three offices (and of unfounded rumours of earlier disorder at the feast of the Circumcision in Paris) see Max Harris *Sacred*

- Folly: A New History of the Feast of Fools* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2011) 86–112.
11. Charles Du Cange *Glossarium mediae et infimae latinitatis* [1678] 10 vols (Paris: Librairie des Sciences et des Arts, 1937–1938) sv *kalendae* (4 481–4). For Viviers, see also *Collection des meilleurs dissertations, notices et traités particuliers relatifs à l'histoire de France* edited C. Leber, 20 vols (Paris: G.-A. Dentu, 1826–1838) 9 361–63; E.K. Chambers *The Mediaeval Stage* 2 vols (London: Oxford University Press, 1903) 1 315–17; Harris *Sacred Folly* 151–3. For Toul, see also Marcel Jérôme Rigollot *Monnaies inconnues des évêques des innocens, des fous, et de quelques autres associations singulières du même temps* edited C. Leber (Paris: Merlin, 1837) 41–46; Chambers *Mediaeval Stage* 1 347–8; Harris *Sacred Folly* 246–7.
 12. Paul Lehmann *Die Parodie im Mittelalter* (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 1963) 233–41. Terence Dolan 'Writing in Ireland' in *The Cambridge History of Medieval English Literature* edited David Wallace (Cambridge UP, 1999) 208–28 (215), dates British Library, MS Harley 913, the earliest surviving source of the *Missa de potatoribus*, to 'some time around the year 1330', when it was probably compiled 'by Franciscans in Ireland'.
 13. Ilvonen *Parodies*; Lehmann *Parodie*; Martha Bayless *Parody in the Middle Ages: The Latin Tradition* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1996). Martha Bayless (personal communication, 16 February 2011) writes, 'I can say with conviction that I've never seen the Kyrie Asini in any medieval text'. Regarding sixteenth- and seventeenth-century collections of parodies, she adds, 'In trawling through manuscripts for my parody book, I found a number of early modern compendia of pseudo-medieval texts like this. Several manuscripts had nothing but parody after parody — dozens of them'. While it is possible that the *Kyrie Asini* lies buried in such a manuscript, she concludes, 'I'm certain that I haven't seen it myself'.
 14. *The Feast of Fools* New London Consort, directed Philip Pickett [1992], CD, L'Oiseau-Lyre 433 194–2 (1994), track 10. An earlier recording of music supposedly having its source in the Feast of Fools, *La Messe des Fous*, Berry Hayward Consort, CD, BNL 112746 (1988), wisely omitted the *Kyrie Asini*. So, later, did *La Fête des Fous: Perotin, Pierre de Corbeil, Gautier de Coinci. Manuscrit de Sens, chansons et conduits du XIIIe siècle* Obsidienne directed Emmanuel Bonnardot, CD, Calliope CAL 934 (2005).
 15. In a response to my written inquiry about the source of the *Kyrie Asini*, Edda Clemencic (personal communication, 1 February 2011) wrote: *Mein Mann bedauert, aber es ist ihm unmöglich, nach so langer Zeit — mehr als 35 Jahre! — diese Quelle zu finden* ('My husband regrets, but it is impossible for him, after so long a time — more than 35 years! — to find this source'.)

MAX HARRIS

16. Jean-Bénigne Lucotte du Tilliot *Memoires pour servir à l'histoire de la fête des foux* (Lausanne: n.p., 1741).
17. Chambers *Mediaeval Stage* 1 274–335.
18. Chambers *Mediaeval Stage* 1 287; see also Pierre Nicolas Grenier *Introduction à l'histoire générale de la province de Picardie* (Amiens: Duval et Herment, 1856), 264.
19. Du Cange *Glossarium* sv *festum asinorum* 3 461.
20. Villetard *Office* 86–7, 130–31; Arlt *Festoffizium* 2 3–4. For more on *Orientis partibus*, see Henry Copley Greene 'The Song of the Ass: *Orientis Partibus*, with special reference to Edgerton [sic] MS 2615' *Speculum* 6 (1931), 534–49; Harris *Sacred Folly* 76–8, 101, 107–108. For a recording of *Orientibus partibus* that remains faithful to its original character as unaccompanied chant, see *A Medieval Christmas* New York's Ensemble for Early Music, directed Frederick Renz, Ex Cathedra 70070–29001–2 (1998) track 14.
21. For the full text of Foy de Saint-Hilaire's letter, see *Lettres autographes de la collection de Troussures* edited Paul Denis (Paris: Champion, 1912) 311–313. Greene 'Song of the Ass' 536, argues for the dependence of the editors of Du Cange on Foy de Saint-Hilaire's letter. For further discussion of the letter, see Harris *Sacred Folly* 78–85.
22. The Ensemble Guillaume Dufay's *Officium festi fatuorum*, recorded six months earlier (March 1979) than the Clemencic Consort's *Fête de l'Âne* (September 1979), takes a very different approach to the music of the Feast of Fools. Relying almost entirely on the Sens Office of the Circumcision, the Ensemble Guillaume Dufay performs the music more or less as written. Its only concession to the prevailing narrative is a few restrained *hinhans* after the closing *Ite missa est* (track 24).
23. *Feast of Fools* New London Consort, track 10.
24. The correct Latin elision would be *ergasine* not *erguasine*: see e.g. the discussion of the abridgment of the final -o in Jean Soubiran *L'Élision dans la poésie latine* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1966), 46, 242–4. I am grateful to David Klausner for drawing this to my attention.
25. *Tempus Festorum: Musique médiévale au temps de la Nativité* Ensemble Anonymus directed Claude Bernatchez, CD, Analekta FLX 2 3106 (1997), track 11c.
26. Ward Peinen 'Van speelmannen en zotte refreinen' in *De Zotte Schilders* edited Jan Op de Beeck, Eric De Bruyn, and Ward Peinen (Ghent: Snoeck, 2003) 31–43 at 42.
27. Cullin 'Notices' 236.